

	<p style="text-align: center;">ADVISORY NEIGHBORHOOD COMMISSION 3C GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA <i>CATHEDRAL HEIGHTS • CLEVELAND PARK</i> <i>MASSACHUSETTS AVENUE HEIGHTS</i> <i>MCLEAN GARDENS • WOODLEY PARK</i></p>
<p>Single Member District Commissioners 01-Lee Brian Reba; 02- Gwendolyn Bole; 03-David Valdez 04- Arthur Barkmann; 05- Margaret Siegel; 06-Carl Roller 07- Victor Silveira; 08-Catherine May; 09-Nancy MacWood</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">P.O. Box 4966 Washington, DC 20008 Website http://www.anc3c.org Email all@anc3c.org</p>

ANC 3C Resolution No. 2015-047
Regarding HPRB Application for Construction of new DCPL Cleveland Park Branch Library at 3310 Connecticut Avenue, NW

Whereas the District of Columbia Public Library (DCPL) has filed with the Historic Preservation Review Board (HPRB) a proposal to replace the Cleveland Park Library with a new branch library building; and

Whereas the Cleveland Park Library is a non-contributing building on Connecticut Avenue in the Cleveland Park Historic District and is also within the Cleveland Park Neighborhood Commercial Overlay District; and

Whereas there are several unique features of the Cleveland Park Historic District, including
-a full range of architectural styles popular from 1894 to 1941, the period of significance;
-large trees defining the streetscape that is often hilly and curvy and that was earlier described as rural in character and is more recently described as a village; and
-a planned commercial area centered on a broad boulevard with wide sidewalks and low scale buildings with restrained facades; and

Whereas the commercial overlay supports the planned development and historic scale of the commercial area by limiting heights of buildings to 40 feet and building mass to no more than 100% of the lot square footage, which allows the cohesiveness of a small commercial center to be maintained; and

Whereas the intent of mapping the Cleveland Park commercial area on Connecticut Avenue with both historic designation and an overlay that restricts the development envelope and promotes neighborhood serving commercial establishments was to link the low scale residential neighborhood with a low scale commercial area; and

Whereas the 1916 fire station was the first support service built on Connecticut Avenue and its structure embodied a domestic architecture (colonial revival) at a domestic scale that utilized “monumental materials” (the stone base) and elaborate ornamentation to provide a civic presence while establishing the future scale of the commercial area; and

Whereas the Cleveland Park Connecticut Avenue commercial area was designated in a 1920 zoning ordinance that established four small commercial precincts of no more than three blocks each on Connecticut Avenue north of Rock Creek Park, which was intended to foster a unique relationship between the residential neighborhood and the commercial area that would serve it; and

Whereas this planning and zoning feature remains unique in Washington, DC, and is especially noteworthy in Cleveland Park because the commercial area has maintained its scale, cohesiveness, and character; and

Whereas the Cleveland Park commercial district is an intact assemblage of primarily brick and stone, one- and two-story commercial buildings constructed primarily in the 1920's and 30's; and

Whereas the east side of the commercial area displays a linear strip of small and varied shops and the west side features the Art Deco commercial design style popular in the 1930's and the influence of the ground breaking Park and Shop, the first shopping center in Washington, D.C.; and

Whereas the rhythm of the commercial blocks is characterized by late teens and early 1920's red or yellow brick 4-5 story apartment buildings with horizontal banding anchoring the corners of a few of the local cross streets with mostly single story buildings lining Connecticut Avenue in between the taller, but restrained structures; and

Whereas the civic buildings (fire house and post office) and the apartment buildings are organized with a symmetrical central mass that complements the smaller commercial structures and seamlessly joins the commercial area to the residential neighborhood; and

Whereas "the scale, materials and decorative details, and the rhythm created by tall and short, projecting and receding, and the general overall appearance and feel of the streetscape combine to make this a very human and appealing place in which to do one's shopping. It is conducive to the community spirit which is so much a part of Cleveland Park and it is compatible with the residential architecture;"¹ and

Whereas there is an interrelatedness and interdependence between the residential and commercial that distinguishes the Cleveland Park Historic District; and

Whereas DCPL has premised its design proposal for the Cleveland Park Library on a commitment that it would uniquely represent Cleveland Park and no other part of the city:

Be It Resolved that Advisory Neighborhood Commission 3C (ANC) has no objection to the demolition of the current library since it is a non-contributing building to the Cleveland Park Historic District;

Be It Resolved that the ANC urges the HPRB to include in its approach to this challenge and opportunity to construct a new building in a prominent location in the Cleveland Park Historic District - indeed perhaps the most prominent since it was the site of the lodge that marked the entrance to Cleveland Park in the 1890's - three goals: maintaining the established scale, using materials to announce a civic use in a basically domestic building form, and creating a warm and welcoming exterior that will announce the cozy, functional and safe interior that residents have requested;

Be It Resolved that the ANC finds that the architect has strived to accomplish these goals but that further refinement of the design and reconsideration of the building organization to better emphasize design concepts featured in the historic district would improve the proposal, including

-a central organizing theme for the front façade that places the greatest height on Connecticut Avenue and that steps down the side sections fronting on Macomb and Newark Streets;

¹ U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, National Register of Historic Places, Cleveland Park Historic District, Washington, D.C., Section No. 8, Page 40

- a reconsideration of the sum of parts theme on Macomb and Newark Streets in favor of a more cohesive design;
- reducing the size of the 42 foot by 32 foot curtain wall structure on Macomb Street that will only have a view of the side of an apartment building and its service driveway, and reducing the taller curtain wall structure on Newark Street that will present as the tallest component of the building given the upward slope of Newark Street and which will have a view of a surface parking lot; and
- choosing one material as a predominant and coalescing statement for the structure and adopting a complementary material for detail and decorative features;

Be It Further Resolved that the ANC finds that there are practical and safety concerns arising from the design that we urge the HPRB to address, including

- the proposed Macomb Street and Newark Street balconies that may not be functional on a daily basis or safe and, if not, should be removed from the design with the option of dedicating that square footage to program;
- the location and size of the loading dock driveway that appears on the site plan to be as narrow as the existing driveway but would be squeezed into the lot line adjoining a residential property. It may not allow access for trucks as the current loading driveway is not accessible - pulling the proposed structure farther from the house would allow the driveway to function better and would provide more comfortable open space buffer between commercial and residential property; and
- the location and design of the children's garden which is accessible only from the children's section (residents have noted this bright and inviting area has been moved to the darkest part of the library), but would presumably be open to adults who would have to walk through the children's section to access it; the ANC questions the advisability of the circulation pattern and the design that features wide steps and low seating walls, and urges the HPRB to ask DCPL to reevaluate the children's garden concept and consider an outdoor space that would be used by all library patrons;

Be It Resolved that the ANC appreciates the inclusion in the revised plans of three of the four memorial plaques and urges that the remaining bench and plaque be incorporated into the landscaping plan, as well as the children's section glass panel etchings be used as features in the children's section;

Be It Resolved that the ANC would like the opportunity to review any significant changes in the design recommended by the HPRB or Commission of Fine Arts and that the Chair and Commissioner representing ANC 3C09 are authorized to represent the commission on this matter.

Attested by



Catherine May
Vice-Chair, on December 15, 2015

This resolution was approved by a voice vote, on December 15, 2015 at a scheduled and noticed public meeting of ANC 3C at which a quorum (a minimum of 5 of 9 commissioners) was present.