

# ADVISORY NEIGHBORHOOD COMMISSION 3C

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

CATHEDRAL HEIGHTS • CLEVELAND PARK MASSACHUSETTS AVENUE HEIGHTS McLEAN GARDENS • WOODLEY PARK

Single Member District Commissioners 01-Lee Brian Reba \* 02-Gwendolyn Bole \* 03-Jessica Wasserman 04-Beau Finley \* 05-Emma Hersh \* 06-Angela Bradbery 07- Maureen Boucher Kinlan \* 08-Vacant \* 09-Nancy MacWood P.O. Box 4966 Washington, DC 20008 Website http://www.anc3c.org Email all@anc3c.org

## Minutes Advisory Neighborhood Commission 3C September 17, 2018 Special Public Meeting Cleveland Park Library, 3310 Connecticut Avenue, NW 7:30PM

## Establishment of Quorum:

The Chair, Commissioner MacWood, called the meeting to order at 7:31 pm and announced that there was a quorum. Commissioners Reba and Wasserman were absent.

## Verification of Notice:

The Chair confirmed that notice of the meeting had been sent to eight local community listservs, apartment listserv moderators, published in the Northwest Current Newspaper, was on the ANC3C website and Twitter.

## Approval of Agenda:

Commissioner MacWood moved approval of the agenda. Motion was approved by voice vote.

## Announcements:

Rich Harrington is the New Ward 3 Liaison (replacing Ian Maggerd). His number is 202-341-7706. Commissioner MacWood said the HPRB would review the feasibility study for the John Eaton School modernization at its meeting on Oct. 4.

## Community Forum:

- 1. Dave Crewcott wants to invite everyone to become a part of the retrocession of DC to live in Douglass County, Maryland. Check out douglasscounty.org for more information.
- 2. Katie Mustian is the new Community Liaison for DCPS. Her email is katherine.mustian@dc.gov.
- 3. Nicolas Mendelsohn is here tonight from Councilmember Cheh's office.
- 4. Alberto Sorto, founder of "Your DC" new firm in DC, introduced himself and his company. Check out Yourdc.org for more information.

## Consent Calendar:

None

## Commission Business:

1. Consideration of a Board of Zoning Adjustment application for National Cathedral School at 3612 Woodley Road NW (BZA #18233-A) for a Special Exception to increase enrollment by 15 students and to increase FTE staff by 10

Jeff Griffin, chairman of the NCS board of trustees, made a presentation. Commissioner MacWood presented and made a motion of no objection to the Board of Zoning Adjustment application. Motion was approved by voice vote.

2. Consideration of a Board of Zoning Adjustment application for 2619-2623 Wisconsin Avenue NW (BZA #19751) for a Special Exception to build and operate a Continuing Care Retirement Community with 38 residential units and 9 on-site parking spaces on an R-1-B lot. A second Special Exception is requested to reduce the parking requirement from 18 spaces to 9 spaces.

Representatives from Perkins-Eastman, Gorove Slade, and the Guest Services Senior Living presented information. Commissioner MacWood read and moved the resolution. Commissioner Bole made a friendly amendment. Commissioner MacWood accepted. Motion was approved by voice vote. See Attachment A. Commissioner MacWood mentioned that a letter came from Councilmember Cheh today asking DDOT reconsider its study of parking and transportation for the facility.

3. Consideration of a Historic Preservation Review Board application (#HPA-18-606) for a two-story rear addition including porte cochere and enlargement of front facade windows for 3118 Quebec Place NW

Mark McInturff, architect, made a presentation. Commissioner Hersh read and moved the resolution. Motion was approved by voice vote. See Attachment B.

4. Consideration of a Historic Preservation Review Board application (#HPA-18-534) for a three-story rear addition at 3300 Newark Street NW

Sean Ruppert, co-owner and architect, made a presentation. Commissioner MacWood read and moved a resolution on the application. Motion was approved by voice vote. See Attachment C.

## 5. Consideration of a Historic Preservation Review Board application (#HPA-18-611) for oneand two-story additions to side and rear facades for 2929 Macomb Street NW

Daniel Jacobeen, architect, made a presentation. Commissioner MacWood read and moved a resolution on the application. Motion was approved by voice vote. See Attachment D.

6. Consideration of a Resolution regarding DDOT draft guidelines on Small Cell Technology Commissioner Bradbery read and moved a resolution on the legislation. Commissioner Finley recused himself from the vote because of his employment. Motion was approved by voice vote. See Attachment E.

## Other Business:

Website Update: None

Commissioner Bole moved adoption of the July 16, 2018 and the August 15, 2018 minutes. Motion was approved by voice vote.

Treasurer's Report: The ANC is in the process of transferring information over from former Treasurer Brink to current Treasurer Bradbery.

SMD reports: Commissioner Bole is working on the McDonald's renovation and is quite pleased. It is likely that the applicant is going to take down the ugly fence and put the trash inside.

Commissioner Finley said the CP Mug Club is meeting at Hellbender Brewing Company at 1pm this Saturday.

Commissioner Hersh said that Emergency tree limb cutting in anticipation of Hurricane Florence took place. She also met with Councilmember Cheh regarding a Main Street Grant for Connecticut Avenue in the Cleveland Park area.

Commissioner Bradbery said that Roadside Development is breaking ground on the Fannie Mae project. The next step is to have a community meeting on Construction Management Agreement before it comes to the ANC. Commissioner Bradbery and Commissioners MacWood and Boucher had asked the BZA to review the addition of a patio/deck to the shelter. She is also working to get a meeting between residents and the city to discuss concerns about the stormwater drainage at the shelter. She has been working on a Good Neighbor agreement for the short-term family housing shelter and will be talking about storm water management for flooding problems they have. (from Commissioner MacWood): 3C08 will probably have a Foreign Mission BZA application in October from the Embassy of the Republic of Nepal. They are seeking to change their embassy to chancery use.

Commissioner MacWood said that HPRB is looking at massing options for the John Eaton feasibility study. Architecture and design are next. They will have 2 members of the community on SIT team participate in DGS architect selection process.

## Adjournment:

Commissioner MacWood moved to adjourn the meeting. Motion was approved by voice vote. Meeting adjourned at 9:15 p.m.

Attested by

Swendolyn 7 Bole

Gwendolyn Bole, Secretary, on October 15, 2018

These minutes were approved by a voice vote on October 15, 2018 at a scheduled and noticed public meeting of ANC 3C at which a quorum (a minimum of 5 of 9 commissioners) was present.

## Attachment A:

## ANC3C Resolution 2018-030 Regarding MED BZA application for Special Exceptions BZA No. 19751

Whereas, MED Development, LLC (applicant) is seeking a Special Exception, No. 19751, from the Board of Zoning Adjustment (BZA) to build and operate a Continuing Care Retirement Community (CCRC) at 2619-2623 Wisconsin Avenue, and Special Exception to reduce the required number of on-site parking spaces for that use; and

Whereas, the Special Exception is required because the lots at 2619-2623 Wisconsin Avenue are zoned R-1-B, which is intended for single family detached or semi-detached houses and which discourages multiple dwelling unit development (Title 11, Subt. D, Sect. 100.2(f); and

Whereas, the D.C. Comprehensive Plan Generalized Policy Map designates the neighborhood, including this site, a Neighborhood Conservation Area, which anticipates some scattered infill development if it is compatible in scale and architectural character with the neighborhood. The Future Land Use Map designates the neighborhood and this site for Low Density Residential development, and, in contrast, designates the west side of Wisconsin Avenue for High Density Residential development; and

Whereas, the applicant proposes a 2- story with exposed basement level and penthouse, 34-unit memory care facility for 36 senior residents with varying stages of dementia on a block with single family homes; and

Whereas, the standard for review of Special Exception applications for a CCRC, including memory care, requires that the use shall be located and designed so that it will not likely become objectionable to neighborhood properties because of noise, traffic, or other objectionable conditions (Sect. 203.1(f)(5); and

Whereas, many neighbors have raised concerns with ANC 3C that the proposal will increase noise, traffic congestion, parking demand and potentially storm water issues to a degree that would not be contemplated by a matter of right R-1-B use and would be incompatible with residential living; and

Whereas, the applicant plans an open, unbuffered loading dock next to single family homes that would be the sole area for trash trucks, patient transport, ambulances, food trucks, and other deliveries but has not explained how this area would be managed and how it would operate to avoid conflicts in the 15-foot alley with daily residential use of the alley; and

Whereas, DDOT's report, Exhibit 45, states that it might be necessary to restrict or remove onstreet parking spaces, which are restricted to provide residential parking, on Edmunds Street or Davis Place, the streets with access to the alley, in order to facilitate trucks serving the proposed facility turning into or from the alley; and

Whereas, the applicant has not addressed how residents living as close as 8-15 feet from the site could continue to have enjoyment of their properties with the potential adverse impacts from light emanating potentially 24-hours from the proposed large numbers of windows or the predictable sirens and flashing lights from ambulances parking in the loading area or alley; and

Whereas, the applicant has not presented a landscape plan or a plan to buffer the proposed use even though the proposal would build this use up to every lot line maximum that is permitted for single family homes; and

Whereas, the architecture and mass of the proposed facility takes it cues from the apartment buildings across Wisconsin Avenue rather than the single family neighborhood that surrounds it; and

Whereas, the standard for review of the Special Exception request also requires that there will be sufficient off-street parking spaces for employees, residents, and visitors (Subt. U, Sect. 203.1(f)(4), and the applicant is seeking an additional Special Exception to reduce the parking requirement from 17 on-site parking spaces to 9 parking spaces; and

Whereas, the applicant has not provided information about the numbers of visitors or the duration of their visits other than to state visiting hours will be during business hours; nor has the applicant provided a reliable number for staff, including private aides, that may be required to serve the memory care population; and

Whereas, it is likely that many of the prospective residents' families will expect onsite parking as a factor in their decision to apply for residency; and

Whereas, DDOT's report, Exhibit 45 submitted on September 14, 2018, does not analyze numbers of visitors, but states that it is assuming 18 daytime staff comprised of a majority of administrative and support staff and some number of direct care staff divided over 2 shifts, and confirms that there is no parking garage option off-site and that on a typical weekday there will not be enough unrestricted curbside spaces to accommodate even the employees; and

Whereas, the applicant states in its Pre-Hearing Submission that staff levels could be adjusted to meet the needs of the residential population (Exhibit 41, Page 5), which could affect employee parking demand; and

Whereas, the applicant has listed Metrobus service that has stops near the site, but has not offered information based on patterns at other CCRC facilities about where employees are likely to live and what the experience would be relying on public transportation or bikes, including how long it would take from an employee's home to the facility; and

Whereas, DDOT and the applicant conclude that an unspecified number of people coming to this CCRC will use buses or will park in restricted on street parking spaces or will ride bikes or will have access to the 9 on-site parking spaces:

Be It Resolved that ANC 3C finds that the applicant has not met its burden to show that this facility would not create objectionable conditions, and thus, cannot support this application for a Special Exception. This facility would operate on a 24-hour schedule. With 3 shift changes and an undetermined maximum number of staff, 2 or 3 outings per week for up to 36 patients, unpredictable numbers of visitors, ambulances, and service trucks, the activity at and around the facility would be significantly more intense than in the neighborhood.

There is even uncertainty per DDOT's report that the type of trucks expected to serve this CCRC could access the narrow alley without removing on-street parking that is used by residents. Nor has the applicant addressed noise or light issues. The proposed fence behind the open garden is the only buffer element included in this application and that is not sufficient to find this use, as proposed, would be compatible with single family residential use.

Be It Further Resolved that ANC 3C finds that the applicant has not satisfied its burden of showing that sufficient parking for visitors and employees will be provided on-site, and, thus cannot support a Special Exception to reduce the off-street parking requirement. There is a difference between a matter of right project requirement for 18 parking spaces and the Special Exception standard requiring sufficient off-street parking. The applicant has not persuaded the ANC that 18 on-street parking spaces are sufficient given the lack of alternatives due to no garages and 2-hour restrictions on curbside parking. Without some evidence that visitors and employees will ride bikes or will have access to reasonable public transportation (beyond citing the bus route stops), the ANC cannot endorse limiting the parking requirement or suggest to the BZA that the applicant is providing sufficient off-street parking.

Be It Resolved that the Chair and Commissioner 3C08 or their designee is authorized to represent the commission on this matter.

Attested by

fain J. Aulited

Nancy J. MacWood

#### Chair, on September 17, 2018

This resolution was approved by a voice vote on September 17, 2018 at a scheduled and noticed public meeting of ANC 3C at which a quorum (a minimum of 5 of 9 commissioners) was present.

#### Attachment B:

## ANC3C Resolution 2018-031 Regarding a Historic Preservation Review Board Application (HPA 18-606) for Concept Review for 3118 Quebec Place, NW

WHEREAS, the owners of 3118 Quebec Place NW, a contributing structure in the Cleveland Park Historic District, have applied to HPRB for concept level review for rear addition, new door, and enlarged windows; and

WHEREAS, the proposal includes replacing the existing modern Quebec Place one-and-a-half story addition with a new one-and-a-half story addition; turning the existing garage into an open pavilion; adding a gate to the Quebec Place driveway; constructing a new door on the Porter Street side of the house; and expanding three existing Porter Street facing windows to include lower sills; and

WHEREAS, the property's address is noted as Quebec Place but applicant-stated and communityperceived address is the façade on Porter Street; and

WHEREAS, unlike most properties on Quebec Place, the property does not currently have a gate or garage facing Quebec Place; and

WHEREAS, the proposed new one-and-a-half story addition would not extend further than the existing addition; and

WHEREAS, the property owners adjacent the property have not had the occasion to review the proposed plans and provide feedback regarding the project;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that ANC 3C supports the following in the event that all adjacent and facing neighboring property owners have the opportunity to review the proposed plans and state support for or no objection to the proposed plans (as documented and presented to HPO):

ANC 3C supports the proposed design for the garage renovation and replacement of the existing addition on the Quebec Place side of the house; and

ANC 3C has no objection to the proposed design for the new gate on the Quebec Place side of the house; and

ANC 3C requests that the homeowners and architect work with HPO staff to ensure that the design for enlarged windows and a new door on the Porter Street side of the house achieve

the homeowners' goal of increasing light while maximally aligning with the existing windows and historic design.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that in the event that neighbors express concerns, ANC 3C withdraws its support until such time as the case returns to ANC 3C and ANC 3C has the opportunity to hear concerns expressed by neighboring property owners; and

BE IT RESOLVED that the Chair, Commissioner for ANC3C05, or their designees are authorized to represent the Commission regarding this resolution.

Attested by

Vary J: Multoo

Nancy J. MacWood

Chair, on September 17, 2018

This resolution was approved by a voice vote on September 17, 2018 at a scheduled and noticed public meeting of ANC 3C at which a quorum (a minimum of 5 of 9 commissioners) was present.

Attachment C:

## ANC3C Resolution 2018-032

# Regarding a Historic Preservation Review Board Application (HPA 18-534) to build 3-story side and rear addition at 3300 Newark Street NW

Whereas, an application has been filed with the Historic Preservation Review Board (HPRB) to build a 3-story side and rear addition with 2-level rear deck at 3300 Newark St., which is a contributing house in the Cleveland Park Historic District; and

Whereas, the rear yard of this property extends into the Rock Creek stream valley and features a steep ravine that extends across the rear of properties on Newark St. and Macomb St. for several blocks; and

Whereas, the ravine is considered a special feature of the Cleveland Park Historic District; and

Whereas, the proposal includes removing the front entrance breezeway; squaring off the existing setback on the west side of the house with a 2-story addition and expanding to the rear at the exposed lower level, first and second floors. The increase in the footprint on the west side of the house, as proposed, would be approximately 20 ft. and the increase on the east side of the house would be approximately 11 ft.; and

Whereas, the addition would not be seen from Newark St., but would be visible from properties on Macomb St. as are all the houses on this block of Newark St. due to the open and natural condition of the ravine, and for this reason, rear additions receive more scrutiny than rear additions might at other locations in the historic district; and

Whereas, a proposed 9 ft. deep deck would extend approximately 18  $\frac{1}{2}$  ft. from the western rear corner of the addition where it would drop down approximately 3  $\frac{1}{2}$  ft. to a second deck that

would extend to the eastern corner of the addition and project approximately 19 ft. into the ravine; and

Whereas, the ANC received a letter in opposition to this application from 29 neighbors living on the ravine in proximity to 3300 Newark St as well as many additional individual letters in opposition:

Be It Resolved that ANC 3C does not support the scale and massing of the addition and urges the HPRB to guide the applicant toward a more simplified design that would better preserve the prominence and character of the original contributing residence, but the ANC has no objection to removing the front entrance breezeway;

Be it Resolved that ANC 3C believes that balancing the interest in enjoying the spectacular natural setting of the ravine with limited encroachment on the ravine is critical to maintaining this natural resource, protecting the shared views into the ravine, and managing stormwater affects. With this in mind, the ANC urges the applicant and the HPRB to consider removing the lower, deeper deck and possibly extending the upper deck to the east, as is recommended by the CPHS ARC and to address stormwater management before any design is approved;

Be It Resolved that ANC 3C authorizes the Chair or her designee to represent the commission on this matter, and the ANC requests that any further development of this application be reviewed by the ANC.

Attested by

fain de Mallood

Nancy J. MacWood

Chair, on September 17, 2018

This resolution was approved by a voice vote on September 17, 2018 at a scheduled and noticed public meeting of ANC 3C at which a quorum (a minimum of 5 of 9 commissioners) was present.

## Attachment D:

## ANC3C Resolution 2018-033

# Regarding a Historic Preservation Review Board Application (HPA 18-611) for an Addition at 2929 Macomb Street NW

Whereas, an application has been filed with the Historic Preservation Review Board (HPRB) for twostory side and rear addition at 2929 Macomb St.; and

Whereas, the existing 26-foot wide house was built in 1909 and is an original Sherman cottage, which is considered a quintessential Cleveland Park design that is unique to Cleveland Park; and

Whereas, the applicant proposes to increase the second-floor square footage by 63% and the first-floor square footage somewhat more than that; and

Whereas, the 17-foot wide addition would be setback from the front façade approximately 8 feet and would feature a front-facing covered porch with a set of 2 French doors; and

Whereas, the 17-foot wide second floor addition would be setback 15 feet from the front façade and would feature typical Sherman cottage window designs; and

Whereas, the applicant has been working with the Historic Preservation Office (HPO) on simplifying the design and reducing the scale:

Be It Resolved that ANC 3C has concerns about the proportional size of the proposed addition, but notes the changes succeed in maintaining the prominence of the original cottage while providing more living space;

Be It Resolved that ANC 3C has no objection to the application and recommends that the applicant continue to work with HPO to refine the design;

Be It Resolved that the Chair or her designee are authorized to represent the commission on this matter.

Attested by

Vary J. Mulleoc

Nancy J. MacWood

Chair, on September 17, 2018

This resolution was approved by a voice vote on September 17, 2018 at a scheduled and noticed public meeting of ANC 3C at which a quorum (a minimum of 5 of 9 commissioners) was present.

## Attachment E:

## ANC3C Resolution 2018-034 Regarding Small Cell Technology Guidelines

WHEREAS, At least five wireless providers plan to put a total of between 2,030 and 2,230 small cell technology and supporting infrastructure installations on light poles in public space throughout the city to build a 5G network;

WHEREAS, Verizon, Crown Castle, AT&T, Mobilitie and ExteNet have identified locations in the city where they plan to install the technology and related equipment and have signed master license agreements with the District Department of Transportation (DDOT);

WHEREAS, DDOT has worked closely with the companies as well as the Office of Planning, the Historic Preservation Office, the U.S. Commission of Fine Arts and the National Capital Planning Commission to develop design guidelines to address the general standards and aesthetics for the design and installation of the small cell technology and related equipment;

WHEREAS, DDOT notified ANCs only in late August about the development of the small cell technology design guidelines and held just one informational meeting on Sept. 6 for all ANC commissioners that was not well advertised;

WHEREAS, DDOT is giving the public and ANCs only until Oct. 5 to comment on the guidelines - just under a month from the date of the informational meeting;

WHEREAS, representatives of the carriers at the informational meeting refused to provide dimensions of the boxes that are part of the small cell technology infrastructure, claiming the information was proprietary;

WHEREAS, pictures provided at the meeting show the boxes and other equipment installed on light poles, but from a distance, making it difficult to discern the actual size of the boxes;

WHEREAS, DDOT has not provided an analysis of how the small cell technology program will affect neighborhoods or arterial roadways, and maps provided at the information meeting that show proposed small cell technology installation locations are small and blurry;

WHEREAS, in the guidelines, DDOT notes the unique nature of the District's streetscape and states that the public space enhances the quality of life for residents and visitors, and ensures that the city has the foundation to become a more walkable and sustainable city;

WHEREAS, the already-executed Master Agreement charges the carriers fees for installing the small cell technology on poles and notes that the District may require carriers to provide equipment for the Smart City program but the District would pay them for it. The Master Agreement doesn't require the carriers to provide any other public benefit to District residents;

WHEREAS, the Master Agreement (Section 5.4.4), states that before applying for a permit for the first installation, carriers must notify ANCs and the Ward councilmember of the carrier's plans to install small cell technology in the neighborhood. However, under the draft guidelines, ANCs will have an opportunity to review and comment on proposed installations only if they are <u>not</u> consistent with the guidelines. Applications that comply with the guidelines "will be processed by DDOT's Public Space Regulation Division" (Section 4.2.1). It is unclear what opportunity to review and comment, if any, ANCs will have on these installations;

WHEREAS, the Master Agreement has other potentially problematic provisions (see Attachment A);

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the ANC3C:

Finds that residents and ANCs were omitted from the development of the Master License Agreement, which sets important terms, conditions and requirements carriers must meet and outlines specific limitations and prohibitions that carriers must abide by to install equipment in public space;

Finds that residents and ANCs were omitted from the development of the small cell technology design guidelines until a month before the Public Space Committee vote on them, and further finds that a month is not enough time for resident and ANC review;

Calls on DDOT to delay consideration of the guidelines until informational meetings about the small cell technology can be held in each ward, the D.C. Council has held hearings, and residents and ANCs have had ample opportunity to comment;

Finds that not enough detail about the deployment of the technology and supporting infrastructure and their effects on the streetscape have been provided to the public;

Recommends that the guidelines be amended to ensure that ANCs have 30 days to review and comment on all proposed small cell technology installations - not just those that don't meet the guidelines - and a process should be put in place to review and hear ANC objections if they are made.

Finds that execution by the city of the Master Agreement was premature, and the city should agree to amend the agreements based on feedback from residents and ANCs (including the feedback provided in ANC3C's detailed comments, Attachment A);

Recommends the city ask the carriers to provide additional benefits to residents - such as providing free wifi in disadvantaged areas of the city - in exchange for installing their technology in public space.

FURTHER, BE IT RESOLVED that the Chair and Commissioner for ANC3C06 or their designees are authorized to represent the Commission in this matter.

Attested by

Harry J. Multad

Nancy J. MacWood

Chair, on September 17, 2018

This resolution was approved by a voice vote on September 17, 2018 at a scheduled and noticed public meeting of ANC 3C at which a quorum (a minimum of 5 of 9 commissioners) was present.