

ADVISORY NEIGHBORHOOD COMMISSION 3C

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

CATHEDRAL HEIGHTS • CLEVELAND PARK MASSACHUSETTS AVENUE HEIGHTS McLEAN GARDENS • WOODLEY PARK

Single Member District Commissioners 01-Lee Brian Reba * 02-Gwendolyn Bole * 03-David Valdez 04-Arthur Barkmann* 05-Margaret Siegel * 06-Carl Roller 07- Victor Silveira * 08-Catherine May * 09-Nancy MacWood P.O. Box 4966 Washington, DC 20008 Website http://www.anc3c.org Email all@anc3c.org

MINUTES Advisory Neighborhood Commission 3C December 12, 2016 Public Meeting Library of Woodley, Maret School, 3000 Cathedral Avenue NW 7:30PM

I. Establishment of Quorum:

The Chair, Commissioner May, called the meeting to order at 7:30pm and announced that there was a quorum. Six of the other seven Commissioners were present. Commissioner Lee Brian Reba was absent.

II. <u>Verification of Notice (List serves: CP, WP, MAHCA, CAH, MG, OG, QH, Ward3DC, and NWC, Twitter, and on the ANC3C</u> website)

The Chair confirmed that notice of the meeting had been sent to seven community list serves, published in the Northwest Current Newspaper, Twitter and was on the ANC3C website.

III. Approval of Agenda:

Commissioner Bole moved approval of the agenda. Motion passed by voice vote.

IV. Announcements:

Commissioner MacWood expressed her appreciation to retiring Commissioners (May, Valdez, Barkmann, Silveira, and Siegel), noting their added value to discussions and Commission work.

Commissioner Siegel proffered the brochure, printed through the grant provided by ANC3C, for the centennial celebration of Engine Company 28.

Commissioner Bole reminded the community that Commissioner MacWood had been selected as one of 40 to receive the Community Cornerstone award. Councilmember Bonds will bestow the award on January 2, 2017.

Jane Irvin (MACHA) expressed her thanks to Commissioner May for her service over the last 10 years, as well as Commissioner MacWood for her continued service and past 16 years of service.

Commissioner Siegel announced that the Architecture Design Team for the Ward 3 Short-term Housing Facility will present design plans to the community, on Tuesday December 13, 2016 at Washington Hebrew Congregational, beginning at 6"30pm. Laura Zeilinger will also outline needs for the facility.

Phil Thomas, (Mayor's Office of Community Relations) presented outgoing commissioners a letter of thanks for their service.

Richard Lake (Roadside Development) introduced himself and provided a quick overview of the plans for 3900 Wisconsin Avenue, the Fannie Mae property. He will have an interactive website for the site, that allows the community to ask questions and make comments. He can be reached at <u>rlake@roadsidellc.com</u>

V. <u>Community Forum</u>: Members of the public are invited to ask questions and raise concerns about issues that are not otherwise on the agenda.

Community member is concerned about restaurant patrons parking on Woodley Road between 38th Street and Idaho Avenue. She has reached out to the Buzotto Group to get relief for non PUD restaurants. Comm. MacWood commented that ANC support for more flexible parking benefit per the Cathedral Commons zoning order parking conditions was approved by the Zoning Commission and neighborhood should experience less restaurant patron parking in neighborhood when it is implemented.

VI. Consent Calendar:

- 1. Motion of No Objection to new Alcohol and Beverage Regulatory Administration ("ABRA") Licenses, for the following establishments in ANC3C:
 - A. All Letters/Comments must be filed by January 16; Hearing will be held on March 29 for the following:
 - 1. ABRA license ABRA-104608 by Heritage India DC, 3238 Wisconsin Ave NW.

2. Consideration of a resolution regarding a Historic Preservation Review Board application (HPA 17078) for a basement plus 2-story addition and new garage for 3529 Ordway Street.

Commissioner Siegel moved approval of the consent calendar. Motion passed by voice vote.

VII. Commission Business:

1. Consideration of a resolution regarding a Historic Preservation Review Board application (HPA 16-058) for new classroom building and site alterations for Washington International School, 3100 Macomb Street.

Commissioner MacWood provided the background regarding the application revisions. Clayton Lewis< Head of School, and the Lead Architect, made the presentation to the Commission.

Commissioner MacWood read and moved a resolution on this matter. Commissioner Valdez asked about negotiations with Tregaron Conservancy. Both sides acknowledged their interest in working together, but the Tregaron Conservancy executive director commented that meetings have not resulted in changes to the proposal or in the conservancy's position that it is incompatible with the landmark.

Resolution was approved by a roll call vote:

Bole - yes	Valdez - yes
Silveira - yes	Barkmann - yes
Siegel - yes	MacWood - yes
May - yes	

ANC 3C Resolution No. 2016-050 Addendum Resolution Regarding Washington International School's HPRB Application for Concept Approval of New Construction and Landscaping Changes at Tregaron, a National Register Property, 3100 Macomb Street NW

Whereas, ANC 3C passed Resolution 2016-025 at a public meeting on May 15, 2016 that unanimously opposed the Washington International School's ("WIS") proposal to build a new classroom building and underground garage into the Tregaron historic landmark north slope; and

Whereas, WIS postponed review by the DC Historic Preservation Review Board (HPRB) and requested that ANC 3C consider a partially revised proposal at the December 12, 2016 public meeting; and

Whereas, the proposed changes include a building height change from 27 feet to 28 feet; reduction in garage parking spaces from 45 to 43 spaces; a 2-foot setback on the Macomb Street side of the eastern segment (79 ft. long) of the classroom building; a reduction of 7 ft. in the length of the classroom building façade on the Macomb St. side (now 208 ft. long); and an increase in the multi-purpose building height by 3 ft. (now 31 ft. high); and

Whereas, the proposed changes include the addition of three 4 ft. setbacks in the Macomb St. façade organized in approximately 12 ft. widths at approximately 28 ft. sections along the façade. A fourth setback adjacent to the multi-purpose building is wider. The setbacks would be constructed of dark gray brick with the wider setback constructed of glass. The 28 ft. sections would be covered with aged copper organized over two floors and broken up by large windows. The interior courtyard window wall would have mulleins fabricated of aged copper:

Be It Resolved that ANC 3C recognizes that WIS has reduced the size of elements of the project by a few feet and increased the size of elements by a few feet, and has changed the material palette in order to minimize the impact of the proposed classroom building and garage (an additional 110 ft.) and the Commission appreciates the effort;

Be It Resolved that ANC 3C finds that the mass, scale, and length of the proposed project on the north slope of the landmark is not compatible with the Tregaron historic landmark and thus, we do not change the position taken in Resolution 2016-025;

Be It Resolved that the Chair and the Commissioner for ANC 3C09 are authorized to represent the ANC 3C on this matter and on Res. 2016-025.

Attested by

Catherine May Chair, on December 12, 2016

This resolution was approved by a roll-call vote of 8-0 (one commissioner was absent) on December 12, 2016 at a scheduled and noticed public meeting of ANC 3C at which a quorum (a minimum of 5 of 9 commissioners) was present.

ANC 3C Resolution No. 2016-025 Resolution Regarding Washington International School's HPRB Application for Concept Approval of New Construction and Landscaping Changes at Tregaron, a National Register Property, 3100 Macomb Street NW

Whereas, the Washington International School, which owns 6 acres on the 20 acres Tregaron estate site, an historic landmark that is also within the Cleveland Park Historic District, has filed for concept review of a proposal to build a 34,250gsf building on the ridge above Macomb Street; and

Whereas, in 1912 the Tregaron country estate was designed by Charles Adam Platt, the premier architect of the American Country House Movement, in collaboration with Ellen Biddle Shipman, a renowned landscape architect, with an emphasis on axial relationships between buildings and formal gardens, and the shaping of grand views and vistas framed by woodlands and "wild" or naturalistic gardens; and

Whereas, Platt intentionally placed the mansion on Tregaron's largest hill to afford views of the surrounding landscape and also to allow views to the mansion from the grounds, and similarly Platt located roadways to capture memorable views and to reveal the mansion gradually¹; and

Whereas, one of Platt's goals was to minimally clear the land for the mansion, outbuildings, and formal gardens in order to maintain a sense of seclusion and privacy through tree preservation; and

Whereas, a U.S. Geological Survey map dated 1893 shows the Tregaron site with a prominent eastwest ridgeline and 150 feet of grade change that terminates into two branches of Rock Creek near the north and south boundaries, and that site condition exists today (Attachment A); and

Whereas, the 20 acre Tregaron estate and its entire landscape became a DC historic landmark in 1979 and is registered in the National Registry of Historic Places; and

¹ Tregaron Landscape Documentation and Evaluation, Robinson & Associates, Inc., 14 July 1999.

Whereas, the Washington International School (WIS) leased Tregaron prior to its designation as a historic landmark and during this period an application to construct a single building was approved by the Board of Zoning Adjustment (BZA) with the condition that the causeway (driveway) entrance be relocated to Macomb Street and the roadway be one-way only²; and

Whereas, the change in the circulation pattern transformed the original service driveway into the main entrance to the estate; and

Whereas, the Washington International School bought 6 acres of Tregaron in 1980 and entered into an agreement with Friends of Tregaron, the preservation group that became the Tregaron Conservancy, the private land owner, and WIS to protect Tregaron from inappropriate development and to provide the conservancy and the school with resources to facilitate the maintenance and rehabilitation of the landmark; and

Whereas, that agreement was based on guidelines established by the DC Historic Preservation Review Board (HPRB) and was approved by HPRB in 2006; and

Whereas, that agreement included support for WIS to increase its enrollment, to build a regulation soccer field on the southwest border of its portion of the landmark, to build a theatre/classroom/library building, and to use specific parts of the estate property for program needs; and

Whereas, in approving limited development on the landmark estate in exchange for the agreement, the Mayor's Agent cited the HPRB's comments on the record that the Landscape Plan was the key component of the special merit application; and

Whereas, the current proposal includes a 34,250 gsf science and technology classroom building; 17,800 gsf underground parking structure for 45 cars, which would leave 57 surface parking spaces; replacement of some walkways with brick; rehabilitation of original landscapes, some of which have been planned for some time as part of WIS' obligation per the agreement; and replanting of the north slope below the ridge after construction; and

Whereas, after preliminary reactions to the proposal, WIS revised the proposal by lowering the height of the proposed new classroom building by 13 feet so that the proposal's north elevation dimensions are 27 feet high by 215 feet long, and the parking structure's north elevation dimensions are 6-13 feet high by 110 feet long with an external staircase separating the two structures; and

Whereas, the proposed parking structure would extend 6 feet into the north slope and the proposed classroom building would extend 61 feet into the north slope at the point where it meets the existing gym building, and the construction disturbance to the ridge and north slope, including regrading, would extend from the west lot line almost to the driveway; and

Whereas, the proposed underground parking structure would require the creation of a garage entrance/exit opening in the driveway and thereby effectively reduce the expanse of the north slope and would either result in car headlights shining across the east meadow or mitigating dense landscaping that would mask views in this valley; and

² BZA Order No. 12576, 1978

Whereas, the estate's historic carriage house, which is currently surrounded on two sides by surface parking would have bus parking on its north facing side, an open courtyard on its west side, and the new classroom building, separated by the exterior staircase, to its northwest corner; and

Whereas, great effort was taken to arrange and design the gym and the most recently built school buildings on the estate so that they would minimally impact significant views into or out of the estate, including relocating the gym farther away from the Macomb ridge and north slope, and breaking up massing so that the middle school and AAA building would appear more in scale with the original historic estate structures; and

Whereas, the Tregaron Conservancy Board of Directors found that the proposal was not compatible with the landmark and submitted a report outlining their evaluation of the proposal; and

Whereas, the ANC has received many letters of support for the proposal and many letters of opposition to the proposal:

Therefore, Be It Resolved that Advisory Neighborhood Commission 3C (ANC) opposes the current WIS application based on our finding that it would negatively affect key features of the landmark and is thus, incompatible with the preservation and protection of the landmark;

Be It Resolved that the ANC specifically finds that

1. the location of the proposed classroom building on the ridge would destroy this characterdefining feature and replace it with a long wall-like structure that terminates into another walllike structure housing the garage (Attachment C);

2. the location of the proposed building would also significantly alter the north slope by reducing its depth with building and regrading to allow for construction;

3. the plan to re-landscape the north slope to restore the construction-related removal of the tree canopy and to mitigate the mass of the building does not compensate for altering this important feature of the landmark;

4. the length and height of the proposed classroom building would dominate the views into the estate from the north and would substantially change the experience of entering a private, secluded country estate; and

5. the proposal to build an underground garage and remove some surface parking is laudable, but the necessary intrusion into the carefully planned driveway and the elimination of part of the north slope is incompatible with maintaining the original intent to gradually reveal the mansion by entering the estate through a forested landscape with occasional clearings to reveal views - we find that the original intent has not been lost with the change of the entrance to Macomb Street;

Be It Resolved that the ANC finds that in general the WIS proposal would establish an institutional aesthetic with this imposing new building on a landscape that was designed to have structures minimally intrude on the existing landscape, which is as prominent a feature of the landmark as are the Platt-designed estate structures;

Be It Resolved that the ANC also finds that the length of the proposed classroom building and its scale and massing reads as a wall, which is a design element that Cleveland Park has sought to avoid in the historic district that is characterized by openness and very low walls and fences where they exist; and

Be It Resolved that the ANC appreciates that WIS has listed many historic features of the landmark on their portion of the property that could be restored or rehabilitated and we hope this could serve as a blueprint for continuing the extraordinary work of the Conservancy and WIS to steward the rebirth of this extremely important landmark;

Be It Resolved that the ANC authorizes the chair and the 3C09 commissioner to represent the ANC on this matter.

Attested by

Carl Roller Chair, on May 16, 2016

This resolution was approved by a roll-call vote of 8-0 (one commissioner was absent) on May 16, 2016 at a scheduled and noticed public meeting of ANC 3C at which a quorum (a minimum of 5 of 9 commissioners) was present.

2. Consideration of a letter in opposition of the ANC Omnibus Amendments Act of 2016.

Commissioner May provided the background on the matter. Commissioner MacWood noted that two Councilmembers were going to offer amendments at the second reading on December 20, and that these amendments have not been reviewed by ANCs. Commissioner Silveira noted that the Council is going to vote when a lawsuit is in progress, and reiterated the fact that the bill should be withdrawn.

Brian Powers, party to a lawsuit challenging the Council's compliance with notice requirements to ANCs, noted that the act severs the council and mayor from any responsibility to notice hearings and give ANCs great weight. Comm. May noted that ANCs cannot be parties to any lawsuits, but the change in the responsibility of the Council and Mayor to give notice was included in the ANC 3C letter to the Council.

Commissioner Siegel moved affirmation of a previously sent letter and moved for chair to write a subsequent letter on behalf of the commission urging the legislation be withdrawn. Opposition to the Grosso and Cheh amendments are to be included.

Motion passed by voice vote.



December 1, 2016

The Honorable Anita Bonds Chairman, Committee on Housing and Community Development 1350 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Suite 110 Washington, DC 20004

Dear Councilmember Bonds:

ANC 3C thanks you for your long and comprehensive efforts to revise the Advisory Neighborhood Commission (ANC) law to clarify notice requirements and to improve implementation of "great weight." We have appreciated the opportunity to meet with you to discuss aspects of the current

law and to testify on the ANC Omnibus Amendments Act of 2016. It is with great regret that ANC 3C now urges you to recommend to your Council colleagues that the substitute bill 21-697, which replaces the omnibus bill you introduced, be withdrawn from the consent calendar and not be scheduled for any vote for the remainder of this year.

ANCs have not been given the opportunity to review and comment on significant changes to the omnibus bill which are contained in the substitute bill and which seriously diminish the role of the ANC and the provisions for notice and "great weight".

Notice requirements and response to "great weight" authority are the two most significant means by which an ANC functions to represent citizens. The substitute bill diminishes the notice requirement and thus, the ability of ANC's to exercise "great weight" on potential decisions that could significantly affect the neighborhoods ANC 3C represents. The intentional exemption of the Council and the Mayor from the requirement to extend "great weight" to properly and publicly approved positions on matters initiated by the Council or the Mayor initiated matters which affect neighborhoods is both bizarre and an affront. It undermines the purpose of an Advisory Neighborhood Commission and diminishes the voice accorded to residents.

ANC commissioners are elected every two years, which affords residents the opportunity to continually evaluate how commissioners represent their interests and validate that commissioners are indeed representing their points of view. ANC commissioners represent the same residents as at-large and ward councilmembers do, but ANC commissioners are specifically charged with being the official voice of neighborhoods. Nonetheless, ANCs are advisory and cannot compel any decision maker to follow an ANC's advice. The "great weight" required response to ANC positions has meant that the Council and Mayor - and agencies, boards, and commissions - must acknowledge that a recommendation comes from an ANC and then articulate why the Council or the Mayor has chosen not to follow the ANC recommendation on significant matters where the ANC was noticed that the matter was important. It is a small requirement that informs ANCs and our neighborhood residents why elected Councilmembers and the Mayor didn't agree with the ANC's position.

Rather than validating the role of ANCs, the substitute bill diminishes the ANC role in civic decision making. **ANC 3C cannot support the substitute bill. We urge you to abandon its consideration by the Council and any vote on its passage.**³ We realize that the omnibus bill will die at the end of 2016 and that your enormous efforts to empower ANCs may not include introducing a new bill in 2017. However, we hope that you will continue to seek clarity on ANC notice requirements and provide ANCs with "great weight" influence on the full range of civic matters that greatly affect our residents.

Best regards,

Catherine May Chairman, ANC3C

³ This letter was not considered at an ANC 3C public meeting because the issue arose between meetings. This letter will be placed on ANC3C's agenda for a formal vote at the December 12, 2016 public

meeting. Addendum: It was ratified by voice vote on December 12, 2016, at a properly noticed public meeting, at which a majority of ANC3C Commissioners were present.

CC: The Honorable Phil Mendelson, Chairman The Honorable Brianne Nadeau, Ward 1 The honorable Jack Evans, Ward 2 The Honorable Mary Cheh, Ward 3 The Honorable Brandon Todd, Ward 4 The Honorable Kenyan McDuffie, Ward 5 The Honorable Charles Allen, Ward 6 The Honorable Yvette Alexander, Ward 7 The Honorable La Ruby May, Ward 8 The Honorable David Grosso, At Large The Honorable Elisa Silverman, At Large The Honorable Robert White, Jr. At Large

VIII. Other Business:

- 1. <u>Secretary's Report</u>: Commissioner Bole moved approval of the November 14, 2016 minutes. Motion was approved by voice vote.
- 2. <u>Treasurer's Report</u>: Commissioner Siegel provided an overview of the quarterly report. Commissioner Silveira moved approval of Q4 2016 Quarterly Report. Motion was approved by voice vote.

3. <u>Administrative Issues:</u> Approval of 2017 Calendar, public meeting and P&Z meeting. Commissioner May moved approval of the public meeting calendar and P&Z calendar. Motion was approved by voice vote.

NOTE: Commissioner Valdez left the meeting at 8:47

4. SMD Reports:

05: Commissioner has begun the transition process with her successor.

08: Commissioner noted that the trees in triangle parks are getting damaged from mowers. Has contacted DPW to investigate the park at Massachusetts Avenue/Fulton Street/36th Street.

09: Commissioner provided Phil Thomas (MORCs) addresses which have been neglected regarding leaf removal. Commissioner inquired about Visitor Parking permits. Mr. Thomas stated that even if you don't receive a confirmation email, you should still receive pass within 10 days and please call if it does not show up. There is no deadline, you can apply at any point. Current passes expire December 31, 2016.

- 5. Other:
- IX. Adjournment:

Commissioner Siegel moved to adjourn the meeting. Motion passed by voice vote. Meeting was adjourned at 8:56pm.

The next public meeting of ANC3C is scheduled for Tuesday January 17, 2016, at 7:30pm in the MPD2D Community Room, located at 3320 Idaho Avenue NW. Please check anc3c.org for any updates.

ABRA: Alcohol Beverage Regulation Administration DCOZ: District of Columbia Office of Zoning DCRA: Department of Consumer and Regulatory Affairs DDOT: District Department of Transportation DPW: Department of Public Works HPRB: Historic Preservation Review Board MPD: Metropolitan Police Department ZC: Zoning Commission

Attested by

Swendolyn .

Gwendolyn Bole, Secretary, on January 17, 2017

•

These minutes were approved by a voice vote on January 17, 2017 at a scheduled and noticed public meeting of ANC 3C at which a quorum (a minimum of 5 of 9 commissioners) was present